Near-Drowning and Drowning Classification*

A Proposal to Stratify Mortality Based on the Analysis of 1,831 Cases

David Szpilman, MD

**Study objective:** To establish an updated classification for near-drowning and drowning (ND/D) according to severity, based on mortality rate of the subgroups.

**Materials and methods:** We reviewed 41,279 cases of predominantly sea water rescues from the coastal area of Rio de Janeiro City, Brazil, from 1972 to 1991. Of this total, 2,304 cases (5.5%) were referred to the Near-Drowning Recuperation Center, and this group was used as the study database. At the accident site, the following clinical parameters were recorded: presence of breathing, arterial pulse, pulmonary auscultation, and arterial BP. Cases lacking records of clinical parameters were not studied. The ND/D were classified in six subgroups: grade 1—normal pulmonary auscultation with coughing; grade 2—abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in some pulmonary fields; grade 3—pulmonary auscultation of acute pulmonary edema without arterial hypotension; grade 4—pulmonary auscultation of acute pulmonary edema with arterial hypotension; grade 5—isolated respiratory arrest; and grade 6—cardiopulmonary arrest.

**Results:** From 2,304 cases in the database, 1,831 cases presented all clinical parameters recorded and were selected for classification. From these 1,831 cases, 1,189 (65%) were classified as grade 1 (mortality=0%); 338 (18.3%) as grade 2 (mortality=0.6%); 58 (3.2%) as grade 3 (mortality=5.2%); 36 (2%) as grade 4 (mortality=19.4%); 25 (1.4%) as grade 5 (mortality=44%); and 185 (10%) as grade 6 (mortality=93%) (p=0.000001).

**Conclusion:** The study revealed that it is possible to establish six subgroups based on mortality rate by applying clinical criteria obtained from first-aid observations. These subgroups constitute the basis of a new classification.

(CHEST 1997; 112:660-65)

**Key words:** acute respiratory failure; cardiopulmonary arrest; cardiopulmonary resuscitation; classification; drowning; mortality; near-drowning; prognosis

**Abbreviations:** CPA=cardiopulmonary arrest; CPR=cardiopulmonary resuscitation; IRA=invasive respiratory assistance; ND/D=near-drowning and/or drowning; NDRC=near-drowning recuperation center; NIRA=noninvasive respiratory assistance

Brazil has the longest coastal strip in South America (7,408 km [4,445 miles]). Its warm climate encourages a beach-going culture year round. In 1990, the Brazilian population reached 150 million people, of whom 7,111 (4.7/10^5 population) died due to drowning.¹ Rio de Janeiro has a rescue service responsible for safety along 96 km of beaches, with two lifeguards every 500 m and specialized medical teams in three different care centers called Near-Drowning Recuperation Centers (NDRC). The duty of the NDRCs is to render specialized medical assistance to near-drowning and/or drowning (ND/D) patients, brought in promptly from accident sites. The patients stay in the NDRC until clinical stabilization is achieved, allowing their release, further observation, or referral to a hospital.² There have been difficulties in predicting the prognosis of such patients, because a classification system was lacking. In 1972, Menezes and Costa³ proposed a classification dividing the cases of ND/D into four grades of severity: grade 1 showed normal pulmonary auscultation; grade 2 showed rales in both pulmonary bases; grade 3 showed acute pulmonary edema; and grade 4 were cases of cardiopulmonary arrest (CPA). The mortality rate was as follows: grade 1=0.0% grade 2=0.6%; grade 3=10.6%; and grade 4=87.1%.”

---

*From the Fire Department of Rio de Janeiro, Near-Drowning Recuperation Center of Barra da Tijuca, and the Intensive Care Unit, Miguel Couto Municipal Hospital, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. Manuscript received November 7, 1995; revision accepted March 11, 1997.

Reprint requests: David Szpilman, MD, Aú das Americas 3555 BLII/302, Barra DaTijuca, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil CEP 22631-004; email: sobrasa@ccard.com.br
This study was implemented with the purpose of reevaluating the Menezes and Costa\(^3\) classification and updating it with other clinical parameters to evaluate the severity of the ND/D.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Area and Population Researched**

We retrospectively reviewed 41,279 cases of predominantly sea water rescues, utilizing rescue bulletins recorded by lifeguards on the beaches, from January 1972 to December 1991. These cases were observed in a restricted sample area of 22 km that falls under the authority of the Rio de Janeiro rescue service, and that constitutes 23% of the total coastal area of Rio de Janeiro City. From this population, 2,304 cases (5.5%) were referred to the NDRC during the study period because they had been diagnosed as ND/D requiring medical attention. The remaining 38,975 patients did not require further medical care and were released directly from the site of the accident after lifeguards had filled out a beach rescue bulletin. The medical aid bulletin filled out at the NDRC describes the occurrences prior to the physician’s arrival based on a detailed report compiled by the lifeguard responsible for first aid, as well as the subsequent medical treatment; data were compiled until the patient was discharged from the NDRC or died. In addition, those patients requiring transfer to a hospital had their hospital records reviewed.

One water characteristic was considered important to final analysis: sea water temperature throughout the year in the study area varies from 15°C to 25°C, with an average of 20°C (68°F).

**Initial Management of the ND/D**

A case was considered a rescue case (without near-drowning diagnosis) when the bather had normal pulmonary auscultation without coughing. Any case of rescue involving altered pulmonary auscultatory findings and/or coughing was considered as water aspiration (near-drowning), and that patient received immediate medical care on the beach.

A physician with experience in this type of accident was always present during the initial care. After the bather was transported to a hospital, the physician would conduct a complete medical examination using basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR) until the medical team arrives. The medical team responds via an ambulance equipped with ECG monitor, defibrillator, and medication and ventilation equipment. Medical examination at the scene of the accident covers presence of breathing and arterial pulse, pulmonary auscultatory findings, measurement of BP and heart rate, determination of the level of consciousness, the need for respiratory assistance, and the type of respiratory assistance required. This medical examination and treatment are continuously reassessed and changed, as necessary, during transportation to the NDRC.

**Clinical Parameters Evaluated**

For the purpose of classifying the ND/D, the data utilized were those obtained by the physician during the initial examination. Pulmonary auscultation was classified into three types: (1) normal pulmonary auscultation with coughing; (2) abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in some pulmonary fields; and (3) abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in all pulmonary fields (acute pulmonary edema).

BP was used to classify the ND/D as normotensive or hypotensive. In infants and children 9 years or younger, hypotension was defined as systolic BP less than the minimum systolic pressure calculated by the following formula: 70 + (2 x age in years). Individuals older than 9 years of age were considered similar to adults, and thus hypotensive when the systolic BP was < 90 mm Hg or the mean arterial pressure was < 60 mm Hg calculated by the following formula: 2 x diastolic BP + systolic BP / 3.

Isolated respiratory arrest (apnea) was considered present when spontaneous breathing or pulmonary ventilation was absent, but arterial pulse was present.

CPA was defined as the absence of carotid arterial pulse and spontaneous pulmonary ventilation.

We excluded from the study the ND/D cases for which clinical parameters had not been recorded in the bulletins upon first examination, as well as CPA cases in which no CPR attempts were performed (generally in patients in whom the submersion time had been longer than 1 h), and ND/D cases secondary to other abnormalities (secondary ND/D).

The use of alcohol was considered a major factor in causing secondary ND/D, when ethanol ingestion was reported by the family or friends in sufficient quantities to alter the judgment in situations of danger, or when the estimated ingestion had been over 56 g on the day of the accident. These cases were also excluded from the study database.

In addition to the above-mentioned clinical data, respiratory assistance needs and level of consciousness were analyzed. The respiratory assistance need was classified in accordance with the presence or absence of respiratory failure in three different subgroups, as follows: (1) absence of respiratory assistance (ARA) need; (2) noninvasive respiratory assistance (NIRA) need using oxygen catheter or mask; and (3) invasive respiratory assistance (IRA) need using mechanical ventilation. The respiratory assistance need was based on clinical judgment and influenced by respiratory effort and respiratory rate. Level of consciousness was divided into four categories: (1) lucid when the individual was awake, capable of correctly communicating what had happened to her/him; (2) confused state, when the individual was awake but not capable of communicating correctly about the accident; (3) stupor in cases of extreme drowsiness with little or no spontaneous activity, and response only to strong verbal or painful stimulation; and (4) coma in which the most intense stimulation does not produce verbal or awakening responses and the victim remains unconscious. The Glasgow Coma Scale was not used because some data were unavailable resultant to the retrospective nature of this study.

For the purposes of stratifying the patients into different risk subgroups, the following classification was used, taking into account initially obtained data concerning cardiopulmonary conditions, pulmonary auscultation, and arterial BP: grade 1—normal pulmonary auscultation with coughing; grade 2—abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in some pulmonary fields; grade 3—abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in all pulmonary fields; grade 4—abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in all pulmonary fields (acute pulmonary edema) without arterial hypotension; grade 5—abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in all pulmonary fields (acute pulmonary edema) with arterial hypotension; grade 6—respiratory arrest (apnea) without cardiac arrest; and grade 6—CPA.

**Statistical Analysis**

The clinical parameters for the evaluation of the ND/D patients were analyzed in a univariate form with respect to their
relation to mortality through simple tables by the Mantel-Haenszel method. The \( \chi^2 \) and the value of \( p \) were evaluated. \( p<0.05 \) (95% confidence limit) was considered to be of statistical significance.7

RESULTS
Population Surveyed

From 2,304 cases of ND/D referred to the NDRC because they required medical assistance, 92.6% (2,134 cases) were rescued from water by lifeguards and 7.4% (170 cases) were rescued by bathers present at the accident site (including all fresh water cases). All cases attended on the beach by an ambulance with the medical team had an average response time of 12.3±5.8 min. Of those sea water ND/D patients (2,274 cases), 90% were brought by ambulance and the rest (10%) were taken to the NDRC by citizens in private cars or helicopter. Although lifeguards were not present at all rescues, they were always present during subsequent first aid, except in cases of ND/D in fresh water. The mortality rate of 2,274 sea water cases was 12.3%, while the 30 fresh water cases had a mortality of 16.7% (\( p=\)not significant). The demographics of the 2,304 ND/D patients covered by this study are shown in Table 1.

In none of 2,304 cases were specific therapeutic measures implemented concerning brain protection or brain resuscitation. There was hypothermia (body temperature <35°C or <95°F) in all of the 532 patients in whom the axillary temperature was recorded in the medical assistance bulletins.

Secondary ND/D (associated with another abnormality) that might have triggered or precipitated the accident was observed in 276 cases of 2,126 ND/D cases in which this parameter was documented. The mortality of this group was 13.4%. The most frequent cause of secondary ND/D was the use of drugs (36.2%), most frequently alcohol, followed by seizures (18.1%), trauma (16.3%), cardiopulmonary disease (14.1%), subaquatic activities (3.7%), and others (11.6%).

Of 2,304 cases surveyed, 473 were excluded: 162 due to the lack of one or more recorded clinical parameters (no deaths and 19 were cases of secondary ND/D), 65 CPA cases without resuscitation attempts (all were considered dead [11 secondary drowning]), and 246 cases of secondary drowning (26 deaths).

The remaining 1,831 cases constitute the population analyzed for our classification system.

Classification

The classification being proposed is based on the 1,831 selected cases that demonstrated different mortalities among each ND/D grade evaluated (\( \chi^2=1529.20, \ p<0.00001 \)) (Table 2).

Follow-up Evaluation From the Accident Site to Hospital Discharge or Death

All 1,831 patients were at least initially treated at the NDRC, but 187 patients required transfer to a hospital (Table 3). Mortality for the entire group was 10.6% (195 cases, of which 166 died at NDRC and 29 in the hospital).

Other Clinical Parameters

The need for respiratory assistance was documented in 1,828 cases. Analyzing the different types of respiratory assistance, we observed that grade 1 is characterized by absence of respiratory assistance in 86.3% of cases, and in grade 2 the need for NIRA prevailed (93.2%) (\( \chi^2=793.54, \ p<0.00001 \)). Grade 3 patients used either IRA (72.4%) or NIRA (27.6%), and grades 4, 5, and 6 used IRA in 100% of cases.

The level of consciousness was recorded in 1,662 cases showing different mortality rates (\( p<0.00001 \)). However, when we evaluated the ND/D grades with different levels of consciousness (Table 4), only grade 2 showed greater mortality rate (10%), and this occurred when stupor was present (\( \chi^2=9.20, \ p<0.003 \)).

DISCUSSION

Table 1—Demographics of the 2,304 Cases*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event/Character</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>74.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried</td>
<td>87.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reportedly knew how to swim</td>
<td>46.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lived far from seaside</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol ingestion</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ate ≥3 h prior to the incident</td>
<td>83.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Average age was 22.7±11.5 years; 5.1% were children younger than 9 years.

Table 2—Classification and Mortality (n=1,831*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mortality (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,189</td>
<td>0 (0.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>2 (0.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>3 (5.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>7 (19.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11 (44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>172 (93)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;0.00001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Overall mortality was 10.6%.
Table 3—Need of Hospitalization and Mortality (n=187)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Hospital (%)</th>
<th>Mortality (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>35 (2.9)</td>
<td>0 (0.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>50 (14.8)</td>
<td>2 (4.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>26 (44.8)</td>
<td>3 (11.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>32 (88.9)</td>
<td>7 (19.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>21 (84)¹</td>
<td>7 (33.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>23 (12.4)¹</td>
<td>10 (43.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>187 (10.2)</td>
<td>29 (15.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Need of hospitalization (10.2%) in ND/D cases in association with the grade and mortality. Mortality in the hospital was 15.5%.
¹Four patients grade 5 and 162 grade 6, out of this table, were pronounced dead and thus taken directly to the morgue.

Table 4—Consciousness Level and Mortality (n=1,062)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Lucid (Mort)</th>
<th>Confusion (Mort)</th>
<th>Torpor (Mort)</th>
<th>Coma (Mort)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,085</td>
<td>970 (0)</td>
<td>115 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>322</td>
<td>220 (0)</td>
<td>92 (0)</td>
<td>10 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>7 (0)</td>
<td>29 (1)</td>
<td>15 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1 (0)</td>
<td>3 (1)</td>
<td>7 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>17 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>161 (126)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,108 (0)</td>
<td>239 (2)</td>
<td>32 (5)</td>
<td>193 (138)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Initial consciousness level in all ND/D grades and their mortality. MORT=mortality.

which some clinical parameters—acute pulmonary edema with hypotension and apnea without cardiac arrest—seemed to stratify into subgroups with different mortality rates. These observations were the impetus for a retrospective survey that demonstrated the validity of analyzing each clinical parameter, dividing cases of ND/D into six different grades of severity according to an initial examination.

From the total of 2,304 cases evaluated, the new classification was based on 1,831 cases that presented a mortality rate of 10.6% (195 cases). Cases of secondary near-drowning (which were excluded from this study) did not have significant differences in mortality as compared to the group included in the final analysis. Considering those six clinical parameters mentioned above, we suggest a new classification for ND/D.

Grade 1 includes patients who aspirate a small amount of water, sufficient to provoke irritation of the upper airways causing normal pulmonary auscultation with coughing. The amount of water penetrating the airways is not sufficient to cause alteration in alveolo-capillary gas exchange requiring medical intervention.

Grade 2 includes patients who aspirate a moderate amount of water, sufficient to alter pulmonary alveolo-capillary gas exchange causing abnormal pulmonary auscultation with rales in some pulmonary fields. Generally these patients require NIRA (93.2%). Nevertheless, 1.8% of cases needed IRA, and mortality rate was greater in these (p<0.00001). These data raise the possibility of stratifying this grade into two types (A and B) with different mortality rates. This, however, is feasible only after some hours of evaluation and not on first examination. ARDS, sometimes caused by ND/D, possibly complicated these cases.

Grades 3 and 4 include patients who aspirated an amount of water sufficient to cause a significant alveolo-capillary gas exchange alteration as well as a high degree of pulmonary arterial-venous shunt that generally indicates IRA with early mechanical ventilation and positive end-expiratory pressure. Pulmonary auscultation is that of an acute pulmonary edema with rales in all pulmonary fields, in addition to presenting frequently with pinkish foam in the mouth and nose. They are differentiated from each other (grades 3 and 4) by the hypoxemic period and are therefore subdivided: grade 3 includes patients with acute pulmonary edema by auscultation without arterial hypotension; and grade 4 includes patients with the same pulmonary auscultation as grade 3 but is associated with arterial hypotension. These cases always require IRA and usually remain for a longer period with mechanical ventilatory support. When the patient is not evaluated at the accident scene, oxygen administration may ameliorate the arterial hypotension, leading to an erroneous interpretation with respect to the grade of ND/D. However, as there is no rapid improvement in the level of consciousness with the treatment, the state of coma usually persists. The initial arterial hypotension that occurs in grade 4 seems to be caused by myocardial depression deriving from hypoxia, as described by Orlowski et al.,8,9 rather than by the transudation of liquid into the lung. The presence of coma may be secondary to a reduction in cerebral blood flow resultant from the hypotension and hypoxia.

Grade 5 is characterized by the presence of respiratory arrest (apnea) without cardiac arrest. Cardiac arrest, however, can occur quickly, in this situation, varying from seconds to 2 or 3 min, a phenomenon seen by those working at the accident site. Situations, for example, of “black-out” (which occurs in divers who hyperventilate prior to submerging),10 are generally reverted very easily, if rescue occurs immediately after the loss of consciousness, as water has not yet been aspirated.11,12

Grade 6 includes cases with CPA, independent of the submersion time. In this study, these CPA cases were diagnosed at the accident site. In general, resuscitation is carried out in all CPA cases when the
exact duration of the submersion is not known, or when such time is certainly <1 h. This procedure proved successful in the summer of 1994, when four patients were resuscitated after >10 min water submersion at a temperature above 15°C (59°F) (two died 6 h later and two survived, one with severe neurologic sequelae and the other without sequelae).

The recommended new classification algorithm is presented in Figure 1. Once the classification of a particular case has been determined, it should not be changed during the recovery period or hospitalization.

All cases evaluated were followed up from the initial assistance on the beach until their discharge or death (from NDRC or hospital), allowing accurate determination of mortality rate in each ND/D grade. According to Modell et al.13,14 and Conn et al.,15 mortality rate of ND/D can be predicted from the level of consciousness upon first assessment in the hospital emergency department. We consider their data to be of major importance, inasmuch as it shows the degree of anoxic encephalopathy. In our study, 73% of the patients who were in coma at the accident site died. Although this mortality rate is higher than reported in the literature,11,13–15 we must remember that our work differs from other studies in that it included assistance and evaluation at the accident site. Among conscious, confused, or stuporous patients (1,473 cases), the mortality rate was 0.5%. It was, unfortunately, not possible to stratify the different grades utilizing the evaluated levels of consciousness. Grade 2 patients, however, presenting with stupor upon first examination seem to be prone to higher mortality.

Some authors describe greater severity of pulmonary injury in fresh water ND/D.5,9,19 Our fresh water cases did not show a greater mortality than those in sea water, although the group studied was too small to draw any firm conclusions.

**CONCLUSION**

A new ND/D classification is suggested, taking into consideration 20 years of NDRC activity, accumulating a total of 1,831 cases for which four clinical parameters (breathing, pulse, pulmonary auscultation, and BP) were reported. These parameters were statistically significant in defining the classification of six different grades (p<0.00001). If this classification becomes universally accepted, multicenter studies to evaluate the several therapies proposed in the literature,20 but still controversial, could be performed.

---

**NEAR-DROWNING AND DROWNING CLASSIFICATION**

![Algorithm: Classification of ND/D (Szpilman et al. 1993). The initials RPAP (Respirationarterial Pulsepulmonary Auscultationblood Pressure) help in memorizing the sequence to follow in assessing the classification.](image-url)

---

664

Clinical Investigations
The use of NDRC demonstrates that the number of patients requiring hospital referral may be reduced. Although efforts to improve assistance to the near-drowned patient are great, major successes are due to the preventive work of lifeguards at the beaches (early intervention). Brewster\(^\text{21}\) quotes the occurrence of 2 to 3% of victim deaths during rescue. In 20 years of observation, the victim mortality rate (0.7%) on Rio de Janeiro beaches has been very low as evidence that prevention is indeed the best strategy for this type of accident.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS: The authors wish to acknowledge the generous assistance of the staffs of the Miguel Couto Municipal Hospital and the Fire Department of Rio de Janeiro NDRC, especially my colleagues Adilson Ramos de Amoedo, Newton Tomás, Maria Luisa Toscano, Henrique Wolfgang Besser, Otavio Sena Paris, Roberto Bassan, David Chapman, Ian Mackie, James P. Orlowski, as well as The Brazilian Life Saving Society (SOFASAR).

REFERENCES

1. Data from Health Secretary of Rio de Janeiro. Death statistics drowning in Brazil. Rio de Janeiro; 1991
2. Szpilman D, Amoedo AR, Toscano ML. Szpilman's classification of near-drowning/drowning: analysis of 2,304 cases in 20 years. Presented at the sixth World Congress on Intensive and Critical Care Medicine, Madrid (Spain), June 14-18, 1993; and Eighth World Congress on Emergency and Disaster Medicine, Stockholm, Sweden, June 20-23, 1993
17. NIchter MA, Everett PB. Childhood near-drowning: is cardiopulmonary resuscitation always indicated? Crit Care Med 1989; 17:993-95